To: NH State Board of Education and NHED Commissioner Edelblut

From: Christine Downing, Volunteer Facilitator for Educator Review Sessions of 306 Rules

Re: Initial Review of March 2024 Educator Review Sessions of 306 Rules

Per NHED's public posting of the 306 rules, I will have a comprehensive summary of language suggestions for each content section by April 30th, which is the designated last day for written testimony.

The following is a preliminary executive summary of educator review sessions that were conducted from approximately March 4 through March 29, 2024, related to the February 15, 2024 draft of the 306 rules.

- There were nine (9) full-day sessions conducted in Hampton, New London, Amherst, Meredith, and Gorham, New Hampshire.
- There was one (1) half-day session conducted on a Saturday via zoom.
- 296 educators registered and participated in the review sessions.
- Review sessions covered these content areas: (Bold indicates over 10 educators completed review;
 **Indicates no state academic standards available on College & Career Ready Standards webpage)
 - Arts Education (including visual and performing arts)
 - **Business Education (currently includes mention of personal finance literacy)
 - **Career & Technical Education Programs (Ed 306.20)
 - **Career & Technical Education Program (Ed 306.34)
 - **Career Education Program (Ed 306.35)
 - Computer Science Education
 - **Digital Literacy Education
 - o English Language Arts Education
 - **Family & Consumer Science Education (limited review)
 - Health Education
 - Mathematics Education
 - Physical Education
 - o **School Counseling
 - o **School Psychological Services
 - Science Education
 - Social Studies
 - **Technology & Engineering Education
 - **o** World Language Education
 - **Holocaust & Genocide Education
 - **Personal Finance Literacy
 - **Logic and Rhetoric

State Academic Standards

• 12 out of 21 content sections in the rules do not have state articulated and adopted academic standards (57% of content section rules)

Subject Area	Title of Document	Document authored by:	Publicati on Date	Link to Document
Arts	K-12 CURRICULUM FRAMEWORK FOR THE ARTS	NH DOE	2001	frameworks for web.PDF (nh.gov)
Computer Science	New Hampshire Computer Science Standards Part 1	The 2018 NH K-12 Computer Science Standards is the result of the hard work of numerous	2018	standards-cs1.pdf (nh.gov)
Computer Science	New Hampshire Computer Science Standards Part 2	individuals across the country and state. Work in NH has been informed and supported by many national-level associations, alliances and non-profit organizations, including the Computer Science Teachers Association (CSTA), Expanding Computing Education Pathways (ECEP) Alliance, CSforAll Coalition, and Code.org.	2018	standards-part2.pd f (nh.gov)
ELA	Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts & Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects	Common Core State Standards Initiative Note: RSA 193-E:2-a (IV)(b) (b) Neither the department of education nor the state board of education shall by statute or rule require that the common core standards developed jointly by the National Governors Association and the Council of Chief State School Officers be implemented in any school or school district in this state. If the local school board elects not to implement the common core standards or the common core state standards adopted by the state board pursuant to RSA 541-A, the local school board shall determine, approve, and implement alternative academic standards.	2010	CCSSI_ELA Standards.indd (nh.gov)

English as	New Hampshire	For questions related to state	2020	New Hampshire
a Second	English Language	policy or the contents of this		English Language
Language	Learner Identification	document, please contact:		<u>Learner</u>
	and Placement	Melissa White NH DOE		<u>Identification and</u>
	Guidance Document	Melissa.white@doe.nh.gov		<u>Placement</u>
		(603) 271-3855 For questions		<u>Guidance</u>
		related to WIDA's website,		<u>Document</u>
		resources, or assessments,		2019-20 (nh.gov)
		please contact the WIDA		
		Client Services Center at		
		help@wida.us or (866) 276-		
TT 1/1	II 14 E1	7735.	2002	. 1 1 1 1/1
Health	Health Education	© 2003 New Hampshire State	2003	standards-health.p
Education	Curriculum	Department of Education and		<u>df (nh.gov)</u>
	Guidelines	the CCSSO~SCASS Health		
Mo4la or 4	Common Com State	Education Assessment Project.	2010	Moth
Mathemat ics	Common Core State Standards for	Common Core State Standards Initiative	2010	Math Standards.indb
108	Mathematics	Note: RSA 193-E:2-a (IV)(b)		(nh.gov)
	Wiathematics	(b) Neither the department of		(IIII.gov)
		education nor the state board		
		of education shall by statute or		
		rule require that the common		
		core standards developed		
		jointly by the National		
		Governors Association and the		
		Council of Chief State School		
		Officers be implemented in		
		any school or school district in		
		this state. If the local school		
		board elects not to implement		
		the common core standards or		
		the common core state		
		standards adopted by the state		
		board pursuant to RSA 541-A,		
		the local school board shall		
		determine, approve, and		
		implement alternative		
D1 · 1	N H 1: 77.12	academic standards.	2005	M. 0.337 1
Physical	New Hampshire K-12	This document was created by	2005	Microsoft Word -
Education	Physical Education Curriculum	a team of teachers, consultants, and administrators		K-12 PE Guidelines.doc
	Guidelines	throughout New Hampshire.		(nh.gov)
	Guidellies	Our thanks to the efforts of the		<u> </u>
		following individuals for their		
		part with the New Hampshire		
		Physical Education		
		Curriculum Guidelines K-12.		
Science	Next Generation	The Next Generation Science	2017	DCI
	Science Standards	Standards (NGSS) were		Arrangements of

		developed by educators, content experts and policymakers, using as a guiding document <i>A</i> Framework for K-12 Science Education from the National Research Council. The K-12 academic standards in science were developed by and for educators and school leaders, and as such states, districts, schools, teachers and non-profit education entities may copy, reproduce, alter, adapt, edit, delete and rearrange any and all parts of the NGSS as they see fit and without permission. To limit any confusion, states and districts may not represent that		the Next Generation Science Standards (nh.gov)
		are the NGSS unless they have adopted all of the performance expectations.		
Social Studies	K-12 Social Studies New Hampshire Curriculum Framework	Group convened by the NH DOE. The 2020 revision is still pending.	2006	GLE Stem (nh.gov)
World Language s	New Hampshire Guidelines For World-Ready Language Learning	Copyright, 2018, New Hampshire Association of World Language Teachers, nhawlt.org	2018	standards-worldla nguages.pdf (nh.gov)
New Hampshir e Student choice policy		Unclear. The document doesn't state who developed it.	2014	executive-summar y-nh-student-choic e-policy-march-20 14.pdf

November 2022 Drafts of Content Area Sections

The paragraphs listed below were the standards presented in November 2022 to a small sample of NH educators (approximately 45 to 50 educators). Many revised sections of the rules had the same paragraph copied and pasted, with only a slight change in wording related to the specific section header. Educator feedback during the first day of the event was to return to the existing 306 rules and provide feedback on those standards and not consider the wording in these paragraphs.

Ed 306.33. Business Education Program.

Pursuant to Ed 306.24, the local school board shall provide a developmentally appropriate, personalized business education program that is aligned to state and/or national standards, advances students upon

acknowledgment of competencies, and includes, at a minimum, courses in personal finance, business essentials, and business technology.

Ed 306.42. Digital Literacy Program.

The local school board shall require an integrated approach to the use of 21st century tools, including, but not limited to technology and communication tools, within all curriculum areas through the adoption of a developmentally appropriate, personalized, digital literacy program in learning levels 1 - 12 that is aligned to state and/or national standards and advances students upon acknowledgment of competencies.

Ed. 306.43 Mathematics Program.

- (a) Pursuant to Ed 306.23, the local school board shall provide a developmentally appropriate, personalized, sequential mathematics program in learning levels 1-8 that is aligned to state and/or national standards, which advances students upon acknowledgment of competencies and conforms with RSA 186:13 and RSA 189:11;
- (b) Pursuant to Ed 306.24, the local school board shall provide a developmentally appropriate, personalized, sequential mathematics program in learning levels 9-12 that is aligned to state and/or national standards which advances students upon mastery of competencies and includes at a minimum, courses in numbers and operations, geometry and measurement, data, statistics and probability, and functions and algebra.

Ed 306.45. Science Education Program.

- (a) Pursuant to Ed 306.23, the local school board shall provide a comprehensive, developmentally appropriate, personalized, sequential science education program in learning levels 1-8 that is aligned to state and/or national standards and which advances students upon acknowledgment of competencies.
- (b) Pursuant to Ed 306.24, the local school board shall provide a comprehensive, developmentally appropriate, personalized, sequential science education program in learning levels 9-12 that is aligned to state and/or national standards which advances students upon acknowledgment of competencies and includes at a minimum, courses in physical science, biology, chemistry, physics, and earth/space science.

Ed 306.46. Social Studies Program.

- (a) Pursuant to Ed 306.23, the local school board shall provide a developmentally appropriate, personalized, sequential social studies program in learning levels 1-8 that is aligned to state and/or national standards, which advances students upon acknowledgment of competencies and conforms with RSA 186:13 and RSA 189:11;
- (b) Pursuant to Ed 306.24, the local school board shall provide a developmentally appropriate, personalized, sequential social studies program in learning levels 9-12 that is aligned to state and/or national standards which advances students upon mastery of competencies and conforms with RSA 186:13 and RSA 189:11. The program shall include, at a minimum, 5 courses encompassing US and New Hampshire history, world history, geography, civics, to include understanding a diversity of points of view, and economics.

Presented to new 306 Team 12/22/23 by NH Commissioner of Education

The following paragraph was presented to a working group on December 22, 2023, to potentially replace the different content sections of the 306 rules.

"The New Hampshire education system is built on a shared responsibility model wherein the State adopts minimum academic standards, where applicable, for learning areas. School districts shall adopt academic standards that are at least as rigorous as the State adopted standards and shall adopt

school district competencies that align with school district standards. School districts may use state model course competencies in place of school district competencies."

As a result of past efforts to reduce language and/or eliminate rules related to content sections, the following stipulations were discussed to guide the review of the different content sections.

Per Commissioner Edelblut's January 3, 2024, letter to NH public schools via January 19th *Friday Forum* newsletter:

"Educator cohorts to review language in these sections and categorize such language as:

- Rule language to be incorporated into another or new section of the ED 306 draft. Specify where that language should be incorporated and provide proposed language.
- Rule language to be carried forward for consideration as a modification to existing State academic standards and content frameworks.
- Rule language proposed for content areas not addressed by current academic standards and frameworks. For such content areas, recommend condensed and concise language to serve as instructional best practices to be incorporated into the ED 306 rule proposal.
- Not necessary to the ED 306 rule draft."

15.1% of eductor responses indicated "306 Rules should remain in current content area sections with minor wording changes."

Business Education, Computer Science, Holocaust and Genocide, Mathematics Program*, Social Studies*, Technology & Engineering

84.9% of educator responses indicated "306 Rules should remain in the current content area sections with significant wording changes."

Arts Education, Career & Technical Education, Digital Literacy, English Language Arts, Health Education, Logic & Rhetoric, Personal Finance Literacy, Physical Education, School Counseling, School Psychological Services, Science Education, World Languages

Tenets of Competency-Based Education

A focal point of competency-based education is the inclusive use of future ready competencies (i.e. work study practices, dispositions, soft skills, etc.) to drive the application and transferability of content areas. There are three key missing components of CBE in the 306 rules, especially in the K-8 Curriculum, High School Curriculum, and High School graduation sections.

- 1. The inclusion of future ready skills in the form of a state vision of a learner and a reduced definition of work study practices in the 2.15.24 draft.
- 2. The importance of a body of evidence to determine proficiency related to competencies
- 3. The importance of a balanced assessment system that promotes varied pathways for students to demonstrate competencies.

The elimination of the assessment section from the rules is not supportive of a competency-based education model.

Resources obtained from Aurora Institute (CompetencyWorks Program Director Laurie Gagnon)

- Vermont's policies with Act 77 and the companion Education Quality Standards
- The Washington State Mastery-Based Learning Collaborative Evaluation Report, Year 2 (section on state policy)
- Learner/graduate profiles <u>article from NASBE</u> includes examples
- South Carolina example of going from a graduate profile to more robust support for personalized, competency-based education based on the Education Commission of the State Policies to Support Student-Centered Learning
- <u>Chris Sturgis's paper for MTC</u>) used by Utah, Wyoming, Kentucky and North Dakota states with momentum

Effective Dates of Content Areas

306 Effective Dates as of 3/10/24

Rule Number	Name	Effective Date
306.20	Career and Technical Education	3-27-14
306.25	Comprehensive School Psychological Svs	. 3-27-14
306.26	K – Grade 8 School Curriculum	6-01-22
306.27	HS Curr., Credits, Grad Req and Curr. Prog	ram 6-01-22
306.31	Arts Ed. Program	8-9-19
306.32	Reserved	3-27-14
306.33	Business Ed. Program	3-27-14
306.34	Career and Tech. Ed. Program	3-27-14
306.35	Career Ed. Program	3-27-14
306.36	Reserved	12-17-11
306.37	English/LA and Reading Program	1-18-16
306.38	Family and Con. Sci. Ed. Program	3-27-14
306.39	School Counseling Program	3-27-14
306.40	Health Ed. Program	8-9-19
306.41	Physical Ed. Program	8-9-19
306.42	Digital Literacy Program	8-9-19
306.43	Mathematics Program	8-9-19
306.44	Computer Science Education	8-9-19
306.45	Science Education Program	8-9-19
306.46	Social Studies Program	6-10-22
306.47	Technology/Engineering Ed. Program	1-8-16

306.48	World Languages Program	1-8-16
306.49	Holocaust and Genocide Ed. Program	6-10-22

The effective dates are important because they provide time to implement a complete feedback cycle, which would involve opportunities for working content teams to review language suggestions from the initial review sessions and propose efficient, consistent, and effective language that includes updated and evidence-based tenets related to curriculum, instruction, and assessment in the content areas.

Opening Paragraph to Each Content Area

A consistent theme among educator feedback is the need for consistent opening statements that introduce each content area in the rules.

Proposed in February 15th Draft:

The local school board **shall provide** a/an (insert content name) **education curriculum** in each **elementary, middle, and high school consistent with competencies** determined pursuant to Ed 306.20 and Ed 306.21, which **may include**...

There are several different variations of the above statement. Feedback expressed by educators included:

- 1. Anything after the phrase "may include..." is likely to be interpreted as optional and not a requirement. This substantially impacts the consistency of learning experiences for students from one school to the next.
- 2. The terms "require" and "provide" are also being changed from existing rules to the 2.15.24 draft. These terms have different meanings. "Require" indicates a demand or request; whereas "provide" is the act of meeting or completing a demand or request. These two terms were linked with the helping verb "shall." Educators developed consensus that when linking "shall" with these two verbs, there was an opportunity to use both in developing an opening statement for each content section. See suggestion below.
- 3. The terms "include" and "provide" were also discussed. "Provide" was viewed as a more active process that would ensure consistent opportunities for all students in public schools across the state.
- 4. The term "curriculum" was preferred over "program." To an educator, "program" means a commercially purchased product. If the word "program" is intended to mean an encompassing set of materials, instructional approaches, and curriculum, then that definition needs to be provided. Local school boards provide curriculum and resources. The curriculum should be the local board's responsibility and it should be the work of educators to choose programs and instructional pedagogy to deliver the curriculum. Feedback suggested "program" should be adjusted to "curriculum and instruction" as these are under the purview of the local school district as outlined in RSA 193:E. In addition, with the removal of the assessment section in the 2.15.24 draft, there were suggestions to articulate "curriculum, instruction, and assessment" as a requirement of the local school board. It should be noted that "program" is defined in the Ed 1400 rules relative to Learn Everywhere Programs. "Program" means a sequence of instruction over a period of time, which meets the state competencies of a subject or subjects listed in Ed 306.27(v) resulting in a granting of credit leading to high school graduation.

As a result of combined educator feedback, the following statement is provided for consideration to begin all content sections in the 306 rules.

Suggested Language for all content sections:

The local school board shall require curriculum, instruction, and assessment in (insert content area name) education for grades kindergarten through 12, pursuant to Ed 306.20 and Ed 306.21, which shall provide...

In addition, educators noted there was confusion around language related to different types of schools versus grade levels and grade ranges. The use of this language was inconsistent. Some rules applied to elementary, middle, and high schools, while other language explicitly applied to specific grade levels, such as grades 1 through 8. Educator discussion noted that when language referenced "elementary and middle schools" this was ambiguous because in New Hampshire, middle schools can be defined as 4th through 8th grades. In addition, elementary schools have many configurations between kindergarten through 8th grade. There was consistent feedback that use of schools versus grades needed to be reviewed and intentional choices made as appropriate to each content area. If this is not corrected, students in "elementary schools" that service students through 8th grade could be missing out on "middle school" opportunities in content areas that used this type of language to distinguish what was required at an "elementary school" versus a "middle school." There was also feedback that kindergarten should not be eliminated in some of the content sections. Again, there should be a close review of which content sections are appropriate to kindergarten curriculum, instruction, and assessment and that grade level should be included in those rules. It was also noted that RSA 193-E indicates the minimum standards for public school approval "shall cover kindergarten through twelfth grade."

Alignment to National Content Guidelines

Educator feedback, including specific language suggestions in content sections, is intended to update the 306 rules to reflect what has been done at a national level in terms of the different content areas and student learning expectations. As mentioned previously, the state academic standards are outdated or do not exist for over half of the content sections in the 306 rules. Educators did not support removing rules from the content sections or moving language to the state academic standards because of the "lack of quality control over the state academic standards." It was noted that through RSA 193-E, the 306 rules have "quality control behind them" as state statute requires at least a 10-year review cycle. This accountability cycle does not exist for state academic standards. As such, removing rules and relying on outdated state academic standards would likely lead to more inequities and inconsistencies across New Hampshire public schools.

General Themes by Content Sections

The sections below provide a broad overview of the general themes for each content section. I will provide additional documents for each content area that have revised language suggested by the educator groups that reviewed each content section. These documents will be provided in writing by April 30, 2024.

Arts Education (including visual and performing arts)

- Most reviewers expressed concerns that the proposed changes weaken arts education and move it in a direction of optional programming and coursework.
- In response to the above theme a majority of reviewers recommended that "May" should be restored back to "Shall" ensuring there are equitable opportunities across all schools.
- Nearly all reviewers cited and recommended alignment to a set of national arts standards. References included:
 - Cornerstone Arts Competencies = 4
 - VPA Competencies = 2
 - \circ NCAS = 4
- Several respondents highlighted the importance of arts and that they are foundational to human development, empathy, and expression.
- There were some voices that recommended adjusting programs back to courses.

• There was abundant feedback expressing frustration with the process - the lack of educator voice and a systemic thoughtful review of content sections.

Business Education

- There appears to be some confusion between a business education program and the personal financial literacy program along with the course offerings under a business education program.
- Further there appears to be confusion about the role of business education in a CTE program vs a comprehensive HS.
- Reviewers highlight that language in the current draft negates or contradicts itself with the switch from shall to may yet requiring that 3 courses in this program standard are offered.
- Reinstate shall over may.
- The one consistent theme is confusion and lack of clarity.
- Further review by a business education content team is recommended.

Career & Technical Education Programs (Ed 306.20) and Career & Technical Education Program (Ed 306.34)

- Update to include current CTE courses and offerings across the state
- Proposal to combine these 2 sections under the content area sections of the rules
- Further review by CTE Directors and educators recommended to review suggestion to combine sections.
- Some language changes to update CTE language to reflect current practices.

Career Education Program (Ed 306.35)

- Recommendation to restore language in this section.
- This section is important to exploratory CTE opportunities at the elementary and middle school grade levels.
- Further review is needed for possible integration into other content sections, such as school counseling, CTE, and technology and engineering.

Computer Science

- Proposing minor changes state academic standards in this area are well articulated.
- Please keep a focus on this content area in current rules and rules to come.
- There is a concern about adequate resources, funding and certified teachers. Flexibility is respected if its intent is to support schools in developing their own local programs and tapping into the flexibility for assigning educators.
- Link or include the NH Computer Science Academic Standards.

Digital Literacy

- Significant wording changes to bring rules into alignment with updated ISTE standards.
- State organization provided input.
- Discussion related to maintaining ½ credit course and portfolio options in meeting these competencies.
- Updated language to reflect increased attention related to ethical use of digital resources.
- Consideration of how to include use of artificial intelligence in this content section.

English language arts

- All schools wanted wording of "curriculum aligned with competencies" for reading, writing, speaking, and listening for a variety of purposes, using a variety of strategies using informational, literary texts/a variety of genres and multimedia.
- Authentic learning experiences should be defined and included.
- A small number of schools wanted to include digital literacy as part of English language arts; and wanted to include specifics regarding instruction of handwriting/forming letters, capitalization, using context clues, etc.
- All schools included foundational skills at the elementary level beginning in kindergarten; some
 included evidence based, universal screeners as a requirement.
- Some schools recommended: at least 4 credits required of all students and

at least 2 elective credits designed to provide increased proficiency in the basic language skills or an expanded knowledge and understanding of literature, which may be met by such courses as advanced writing, public speaking, debating, dramatics, humanities, and world literature.

- Clarify some language "environment that promotes reading," and "skillful use of language."
- Replace "good sources" with "credible and reliable" sources.
- Some recommendations/ changes were worded more like competencies: Develop study skills, develop word recognition skills, understand ideas presented in a variety of formats, etc.
- One school included rhetoric and logic as skills to be developed using reading, writing, speaking, and listening.
- Further review by ELA content team is recommended to bridge consensus on some of these varying ideas.

Family & Consumer Science Education (limited review)

- Topics included providing students with knowledge and experience in the following areas:
 - o Foods and nutrition
 - o Human growth and development
 - o Consumer and resource management
 - o Textiles and design
 - o Develop an awareness of career opportunities and to function as leaders in family, community, and work settings
- Authentic assessment of student learning outcomes through multiple formative and summative assessment instruments that are aligned with the state and district content and performance standards.
- Use critical and creative thinking skills to promote problem solving in diverse family, community, and work environments; creative thinking, construct knowledge, and develop innovative products and processes using technology; Use critical thinking skills to plan and conduct research, manage projects, solve problems, and make informed decisions.
- Limited review conducted. Recommendation to provide additional opportunities to FACS educators.

Health Education

- Align to SHAPE (national standards)
- Require highly qualified or certified educator
- Updated curriculum areas to align to SHAPE.
- Include that the local school board requires health education.
- Reconsider the integrated option to health education.

Mathematics Education

- Recommended offering a minimum of 4 math courses in high school or minimum of 3 math + one non-math course that applies math skills and knowledge.
- No schools wanted to eliminate kindergarten.
- Prefer to say "age or grade appropriate" than to say "developmentally appropriate."
- All schools included problem solving, critical thinking, opportunities for extended projects and labs, learning outside of the classroom, interactive learning, communicating in mathematics, applying multiple math strategies and math concepts concrete to abstract, using visual models. These are not explicitly outlined in Common Core State Standards.
- Consideration of how to structure mathematics across the K-8 grade levels.
- Recommend another opportunity for math content team to review draft section based on feedback obtained.

Physical education:

- Aligned with national PE standards/SHAPE.
- There was variation on whether physical education should be offered at minimum once a week, daily, or as a total number of hours at elementary level or at middle and high school a minimum of 1/4 or its hourly equivalent 1800 hr.
- All schools wanted to include a variety of motor skills, physical activity, social and cooperative behaviors during physical activities, and the word "curriculum" rather than a "program."

- Most schools mentioned valuing physical activity for health, enjoyment, challenge, self-expression, and social interaction.
- Most schools included kindergarten at the elementary level.
- Strong recommendation that daily physical activity in Ed 310 be in addition to PE curriculum.

School Counseling

- Nearly all reviewers reported that the proposed changes drastically decrease the quality of education in NH schools.
- Reviewers questioned the timeline given this section of rules is not expiring in 2024.
- Adjust school counselors to student ratios so that all students have access to a counselor. School
 counselors at all levels should not have a caseload of more than 250 students in alignment with national
 recommendations.
- Rules should remain rigorous and specific.
- A "comprehensive school counseling program" shall be required.
- Ensure national ASCA standards are referenced and/or included.
 - Rules should include reference to a competency-based curriculum based on ASCA Mindsets and Behaviors

https://www.schoolcounselor.org/getmedia/7428a787-a452-4abb-afec-d78ec77870cd/Mindsets-Behaviors.pdf. The date for the ASCA Model should be revised to reflect the current 4th edition.

School Psychological Services

- Nearly all reviewers reported that the proposed changes drastically decrease the quality of education in NH schools.
- Maintain language from the National Assoc of Psychologists 2020 standards Assuming this language was stripped and by maintain they mean reinstate. Nearly all reviewers referenced these standards.
- State organization provided a completed draft document of how the rules should be restored and included suggested updates. (Submitted to State Board by C. Downing on April 3, 2024)
- Require NHED licensed certified school psychologists; based on NASP Model for Comprehensive and Integrated Psych Services within NASP 2020 Professional Standards.
- Require first year employment receives minimum 1 hr supervision per week; supervisors required to have 3 years experience as school psychologist.

Science Education

- Updated content areas of science.
- Restore guidance under different disciplines of science.
- Strong recommendation to continue review with science content team as there were not many elementary teachers present to address science at that level.

Social Studies

- Conservative discussions in terms of changes that would call divisive concepts into question.
- Adjustments to align to C3 National Frameworks.
- Added assessing reliability and validity of information and resources.
- Recommend further review by state organization.

Technology & Engineering

- Add physical computing, robotics, and automation.
- Consider an updated version based on the 2022 Technology & Engineering Guide ties with credentialing.
- Further review needed with technology and engineering educators to consider alignment with 2022 Guide.

World Languages

- American Sign Language (ASL) qualifies as a world language.
- Adjust to shall provide instruction in one or more world languages.
- Updated to align to national standards.
- Recommendations for years in a course of sequence for different languages offered.

• Consideration for elementary experiences.

Holocaust & Genocide

- Restore language that parallels what is required by RSA.
- Current rules are strong and 2.15.24 draft needs to restore this language.

Personal Finance Literacy:

- All schools included the following topics, aligned with competencies: earning a living, budgeting, taxes, saving, debt, and banking, risk management, insurance, managing credit.
- Some schools included the following topics: investing, financial career planning/awareness.
- Some schools included skills such as, problem solving, critical thinking, and larger capstone projects at the high school level.
- Further consideration needed in terms of how this is connected to the business education section and integration to economics (social studies) and mathematics sections.

Logic and Rhetoric:

- Feedback indicates more reviews should be conducted to develop this section, including a review of standards and curriculum used in other educational settings.
- Integrated logic and rhetoric curriculum and competencies in grades 1-8, excluding kindergarten
 - o Understand how to logically formulate questions, sort information, compare and contrast arguments, and how to collect, process, and apply the knowledge they have previously acquired.
 - o Become familiar with the skills of researching a subject and its varying viewpoints, and also develop a position on the subject.
 - o Become familiar with the ability to listen to an argument, be able to analyze and articulate the merits of each argument, and explain which arguments they agree with.
- Integrated logic and rhetoric curriculum and competencies in grades 9-12...
 - o Show competency in the skills of researching a subject and its varying viewpoints, and also developing a position on the subject.
 - o Show competency in the ability to listen to an argument, be able to analyze and articulate the merits of each argument, and explain which arguments they agree with.
 - o Provide opportunities to practice delivering a verbal argument, creating and giving spoken counterarguments, forming a personal viewpoint from discussions, and expressing that viewpoint orally.
- RECOMMENDATION: integrate with existing course content (ELA, Social studies, science, etc.) do not make this a separate course.

Overall Recommendations

- 1. Given that a majority of the content areas have effective dates that do not expire in 2024, consider continued efforts to bring content teams together to provide updated language by the end of this school year (June 2024) based on these initial review sessions across the state. This work could involve state professional content organizations.
- 2. Accept educator recommendations to not remove language from the content sections in order to place this language in the state academic standards.
- 3. Consider an in-person meeting to go over specific comments and language suggestions section by section based on the documents collected through the educator review sessions.
- 4. Restore "shall" language in all content sections.
- 5. Determine consistent language for the opening statements of all content sections.
- 6. Accept replacement language for the term "program."

Submitted by:

Christine Downing Volunteer Facilitator for Sessions Goshen, New Hampshire